



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: March 17, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB 16-016

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of March 24, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 – The San Diego County Water Authority/ Frank Hope, Sr. Building**

APPLICANT: Seamus and Patricia Garland represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 2750 4th Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the San Diego County Water Authority/ Frank Hope, Sr. Building located at 2750 4th Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the San Diego County Water Authority/ Frank Hope, Sr. Building located at 2750 4th Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1956 under HRB Criteria C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Modern Contemporary style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1956 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits one story massing, large, aluminum framed windows, stucco exterior with a rock veneer; angular massing and horizontal orientation.
2. The resource is representative of the notable work of Master Architect Frank Hope, Sr. and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is representative of Hope's work in designs for public entities.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The building is located in an area of mixed development with residential and commercial buildings surrounding the subject resource.

The building is located on APN 452-711-02-00. The property was identified in the Draft 2007 Uptown Survey and given a Status Code of 5B, "Locally significant both individually (listed, eligible, or appears

eligible) and as a contributor to a district that is locally listed, designated, determined eligible or appears eligible through survey evaluation.”

The historic name of the resource, the San Diego County Water Authority/ Frank Hope, Sr. Building has been identified consistent with the Board’s adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the San Diego County Water Authority, who constructed building and the name of Frank Hope Sr., who has been established as a Master (Architect, Builder, Designer, etc.).

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott Moomjian which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff does not concur and believes that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City’s, a community’s or a neighborhood’s historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 2750 4th Avenue did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City’s or Uptown’s historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 2750 4th Avenue did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Constructed in the Modern Contemporary style in 1956, the building is a one story office building. The building features a flat roof with no eave overhang. The exterior of the building features stucco on the north, south and the west facades with vertical score lines. With the exception of the front façade, each elevation features metal windows that appear horizontal with a stuccoed frame protruding out around the windows. The windows are evenly spaced on each of the wall planes. The front façade features a stone veneer on the northern half of the building and stucco and rock veneer on the south portion. The entire façade is slightly recessed in the plane which creates a protruding frame around the main façade similar to the windows. The southern portion features three recessed openings-two with fixed windows and one with the main entrance. Within the recessed areas the stucco is scored to make a squared off concentric ring effect. The lower portion of the window is treated with a stone veneer.

As discussed in the *San Diego Modernism Historic Context Statement*, the Modern Contemporary sub-style was ubiquitous in San Diego during the 1950s and the 1960s as a style of commercial buildings and streetscapes. The style is primarily characterized by strong roof forms typically with deep overhangs; large windows, often aluminum framed; and non-traditional exterior finishes. The subject property exhibits all the primary character-defining features of the style. Some of the secondary character-defining features that the house exhibits are found in the angular massing; and horizontally oriented commercial building. The building has maintained its original features and design with limited modifications that do not detract from its historic character defining features.

Significance Statement: The building continues to convey the historic significance of the Modern Contemporary style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including one story, large, aluminum framed windows, stucco exterior with a rock veneer; angular massing and horizontal orientation. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject Master Architect, Frank L. Hope, Sr. (formerly Jr.) was born in 1901 in San Bernardino, California. He attended the University of California at Berkeley, Carnegie Institute of Technology in Pittsburgh and San Diego State University. He worked as a draftsman, designer and project manager for the Historical Architectural firm Requa and Jackson. He also worked with Historical Architects Lillian Rice and William Wheeler. Upon passing the State Architectural Exam, he left Requa and Jackson to establish the firm of Frank Hope and Associates in 1928, located in the Spreckels Building. By 1929, he had 32 commissions for projects. His firm was also known as Hope Architects and Engineers, Hope/BTN, Hope Consulting Group and Hope Design Group. At one time, his firm had up to 150 employees and was not only the largest, but arguably the most important and influential architectural firm in San Diego.

His firm designed many well-known high rise structures, residences, Catholic churches, schools, hospitals, cultural and academic structures and complexes. Among these are the Timken Museum of Art in Balboa Park, the former Aquarium at the Scripps Institute of Oceanography in La Jolla, the La Jolla Repertory Theatre, the US Naval Underwater Warfare Center, the San Diego International Airport Terminal Expansion, Cuyamaca College, the Mesa College Master Plan and Building Design, and the Home Federal Tower (now Great Western Building) which was San Diego's first high-rise structure in 30 years when it was constructed.

Hope was granted Master Architect status by the HRB in 2007 with the designation of the Frank Hope, Jr. House at 371 San Fernando Street (HRB Site #803). Since that time, only one other original design of Hope's has been listed on the local register – the Luigi and Louise Perna/Frank Hope, Sr. House at 2320 Hickory Street (HRB Site # 1065).

Significance Statement: The subject resource retains good integrity to its original design and contributes to a greater understanding of Hope's overall body of work. Specifically, the resource is representative of Hope's work in designs for public entities, the resource serves as an example of the notable work of Master Architect Frank Hope, Sr. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - *Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.*

The property at 2750 4th Avenue has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - *Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.*

The property at 2750 4th Avenue is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the San Diego County Water Authority/ Frank Hope, Sr. Building located at 2750 4th Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1956 under HRB Criteria C as a good example of a Modern Contemporary building and D as a notable work by Master Architect Frank Hope, Sr. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jodie Brown, AICP
Senior Planner

Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JB/ks

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 3/24/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 3/24/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **San Diego County Water Authority/ Frank Hope, Sr. Building** (owned by Seamus and Patricia Garland, 2535 San Marcos Avenue, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **2750 4th Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-711-02-00**, further described as BLK 308 LOT K LOTS C & J & S H OF LOT B & in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the San Diego County Water Authority/ Frank Hope, Sr. Building on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Modern Contemporary style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1956 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits one story massing, large, aluminum framed windows, stucco exterior with a rock veneer; angular massing and horizontal orientation. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as the notable work of Master Architect Frank Hope, Sr. and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is representative of Hope's work in designs for public entities. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney